

**BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD**

|                             |   |                  |
|-----------------------------|---|------------------|
| PAUL CHRISTIAN PRATAPAS     | ) |                  |
| Complainant                 | ) | PCB No. 2023-059 |
| v.                          | ) |                  |
|                             | ) |                  |
| CARILLON AT CAMBRIDGE LAKE, | ) |                  |
| DR HORTON,                  | ) |                  |
| and                         | ) |                  |
| EARTHWORKS ENVIRONMENTAL,   | ) |                  |
| Respondents.                | ) |                  |
|                             | ) |                  |

**APPEARANCE**

The undersigned, as attorney, enters the appearance of the Respondent, D.R. HORTON, INC., improperly sued as “Carillon at Cambridge Lake, DR Horton”.

By: /s/ Gregory M. Emry  
One of the Attorneys for Respondent,  
**D.R. HORTON, INC.**

Michael J. Maher ([mmaher@smbtrials.com](mailto:mmaher@smbtrials.com))  
J. A. Koehler. ([jkoehler@smbtrials.com](mailto:jkoehler@smbtrials.com))  
Gregory M. Emry ([gemry@smbtrials.com](mailto:gemry@smbtrials.com))  
**SWANSON, MARTIN & BELL, LLP**  
330 N. Wabash Ave., Suite 3300  
Chicago, IL 60611  
Phone: (312) 321-9100/Fax: (312) 321-0990

I certify that a copy of the within instrument was served on all parties who have appeared and have not heretofore been found by the Court to be in default for failure to plead.

/s/ Gregory M. Emry  
One of the Attorneys for Respondent,  
D.R. HORTON, INC.

**BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD**

|                             |   |                  |
|-----------------------------|---|------------------|
| PAUL CHRISTIAN PRATAPAS     | ) |                  |
| Complainant                 | ) | PCB No. 2023-059 |
| v.                          | ) |                  |
|                             | ) |                  |
| CARILLON AT CAMBRIDGE LAKE, | ) |                  |
| DR HORTON,                  | ) |                  |
| and                         | ) |                  |
| EARTHWORKS ENVIRONMENTAL    | ) |                  |
| Respondents.                | ) |                  |
|                             | ) |                  |

**RESPONDENT’S MOTION REQUESTING THE POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD NOT ACCEPT COMPLAINT AND/OR DISMISS THE COMPLAINT**

Respondent, D.R. HORTON, INC., improperly sued as “Carillon at Cambridge Lake, DR Horton”, by and through its attorneys, SWANSON, MARTIN & BELL, LLP, pursuant to 35 Ill. Adm. Code §§ 103.212(b) and 101.506, respectfully moves the Illinois Pollution Control Board to not accept the Citizen’s Formal Complaint in this matter for hearing on the basis that Complainant never properly served Respondent and because the Complaint is frivolous, alleging wholly past violations for which private citizens lack authority to pursue. In support, Respondent states as follows:

**FAILURE TO PROPERLY SERVE RESPONDENTS**

1. Respondent denies any claim that its actions or activities caused or allowed pollution or constitute a violation of Illinois law or regulations.
2. Pursuant to 415 ILCS 5/31(d)(1) and 35 Ill. Adm. Code § 101.202(b), the Board will not accept a complaint for hearing if the Board finds the complaint is “frivolous”, meaning the Board lacks the authority to grant the requested relief.
3. The Board should not accept this Complaint because Complainant failed to serve Respondent as required by 35 Ill. Adm. Code § 101.304.

4. 35 Ill. Adm. Code § 101.304(d) specifically provides that a proceeding is subject to dismissal for failure to comply with service requirements.
5. Although 35 Ill. Adm. Code § 101.304(c)(1) allows for service in several ways, Complainant's chosen method of service is via personal service, which is governed by 35 Ill. Adm. Code § 101.304(d). (See attached hereto as Exhibit A, for Complainant's Proof of Service.)
6. Complainant's "Documentation of Service" is improper and fails to supply required information necessary to give this Honorable Board jurisdiction over this matter or Complainant's Complaint.
7. As regards Respondent D.R. Horton, the attached "Documentation of Service", acknowledges the lack of service, and furthermore fails provide any affidavit of proof of service. (See attached Exhibit A, "Documentation of Service".)
8. For personal service on a corporation, Illinois requires delivery of the complaint to a registered agent or other individual authorized to receive the complaint. *See* 35 Ill. Adm. Code § 101.100(b) (applying the Illinois Code of Civil Procedure and the Illinois Supreme Court Rules when the Board's procedural rules are silent).
9. Complainant's "Documentation of Service" is inadequate.
10. A simple internet search of the Illinois Secretary of State shows the registered agent for D.R. Horton, Inc. (of 1341 Horton Circle, Arlington, Texas) at CT Corporation System, 208 South LaSalle Street, Suite 814, Chicago, Illinois, 60604. (See D.R. Horton, Inc., Registered Agent Information, attached as Exhibit B.)
11. Complainant's purported service violates Illinois law.
12. This Honorable Board cannot proceed in this matter until service is perfected.

13. Because there is no proper service on Respondent, the Board should not accept Complainant's Complaint.

**WHOLLY PAST VIOLATION**

14. Respondent denies any claim that its actions or activities caused or allowed pollution or constitute a violation of Illinois law or regulations.
15. Pursuant to 415 ILCS 5/31(d)(1) and 35 Ill. Adm. Code § 101.202(b), the Board will not accept a complaint for hearing if the Board finds the complaint is "frivolous", meaning the Board lacks the authority to grant the requested relief.
16. Paragraph 6 of the Formal Complaint alleges wholly past violations, limited to "fall in 2020".
17. Paragraph 4 of the Formal Complaint alleges violations of 415 ILCS 5.12(a), 5.12(d) and IL. Admin Code Title 35, 204.141(b).
18. 415 ILCS 5.12(a) addresses water pollution identical to provisions of the Federal Clean Water Act, 33 U.S.C. 1251, *et.seq.*
19. Paragraph 6 of the Formal Complaint contains a self-serving narrative of discharges, limited to events occurring more than two years ago, specifically in the year 2020.
20. The U.S. Supreme Court directly and clearly holds there is no standing for citizen suits where the relief addresses wholly past violations of the Clean Water Act. *Gwaltney of Smithfield, Ltd v. Chesapeake Bay Foundation, Inc.*, 484 U.S. 49 (1987).
21. In Illinois, citizens only possess authority to enforce statutes as specifically allowed and authorized by status. See *Glisson v. City of Marion*, 188 Ill. 2d 211, 222-23 (1999).

22. Specifically, 35 Ill Adm. Code § 103.204(c)(1) requires the complainant to identified “...[T]he provisions of the Act that Respondents *are alleged to be violating.*” (*emphasis added.*)
23. The language of 35 Ill. Adm. Code § 103.204(c)(1) unambiguously addresses current violations which are alleged to be ongoing—hence “*violating*—at the time the complaint is filed.
24. The only plausible interpretation for the regulations conjugation of the verb “to violate” into “*violating*” is by application of the present tense.
25. 35 Ill Adm. Code § 103.204(c)(1) is clear that complainants must identify actions Respondent is alleged “[T]o be *violating* . . .” when the complaint is filed. (*emphasis added.*)
26. Therefore, consistent with the U.S. Supreme Court’s holding in Gwaltney (supra), 35 Ill. Adm. Code § 103.204(c)(1) does not authorize private citizen actions alleging wholly past violations, such as alleged here.
27. Complainant’s suit is not brought by the State of Illinois, for which suits alleging past violations are authorized. *See, e.g., Modine Mfg. Co v. Pollution Control Bd.*, 193 Ill. App. 3d 643, 648 (2d. Dist. 1990) (fines for wholly pass violation allowed where action was brought by Illinois EPA or Illinois Attorney General.)
28. This Board implicitly recognized that a private citizen cannot maintain actions for wholly past violations in Environmental Law and Policy Center v. Freeman United Coal Mining Co. and Springfield Coal Co., LLC, PCB 2011-002 (July 15, 2010), when the Board held that a failed permit transfer left the named respondent in (then) current violation of NPDES permit requirements. Further, in Shelton v. Crown, PCB 96-53 (Oct. 2, 1997),

the Board denied a motion to dismiss, finding continued operation of equipment giving rise to the alleged violation. Both of these cases acknowledge that citizens may pursue complaints for current and ongoing violations, which is the opposite of what Complainant alleges here.

29. The allegations here are clear: alleged, past violations in “[F]all in 2020”.

30. There are no allegations of continuing violation or injury.

31. Complainant’s Complaint should be dismissed.

WHEREFORE, for the foregoing reasons, Respondent, D.R. HORTON, INC., respectfully moves the Illinois Pollution Control Board not to accept the Citizens’ Formal Complaint for hearing on the basis the Complaint is frivolous and/or the Complaint in this matter was improperly served.

**SWANSON, MARTIN & BELL, LLP**

/s/ Michael J. Maher/Jay Koeler  
Attorneys for Respondent,  
**D.R. HORTON, INC.**

Michael J. Maher ([mmaher@smbtrials.com](mailto:mmaher@smbtrials.com))  
J. A. Koehler. ([jkoehler@smbtrials.com](mailto:jkoehler@smbtrials.com))  
Gregory Emry ([gemry@smbtrials.com](mailto:gemry@smbtrials.com))  
**SWANSON, MARTIN & BELL, LLP**  
330 N. Wabash Ave., Suite 3300  
Chicago, IL 60611  
Phone: (312) 321-9100/Fax: (312) 321-0990

## DOCUMENTATION OF SERVICE

**Note to the Complainant:** This Documentation of Service must accompany the Formal Complaint and the Notice of Filing. Once you have completed the Documentation of Service, the Formal Complaint, and the Notice of Filing, you must file these three documents with the Board's Clerk *and* serve a copy of each document on each respondent.

This form for the Documentation of Service is designed for use by a non-attorney and must be notarized, *i.e.*, it is an "affidavit" of service. An attorney may modify the form for use as a "certificate" of service, which is not required to be notarized.

### Affidavit of Service

I, the undersigned, on oath or affirmation, state that on the date shown below, I served copies of the attached Formal Complaint and Notice of Filing on the respondent at the address listed below by one of the following methods: [*check only one—A, B, C, D, or E*]

A. \_\_\_\_ U.S. Mail or third-party commercial carrier with the recipient's signature recorded by the U.S. Postal Service or the third-party commercial carrier upon delivery. Attached is the delivery confirmation from the U.S. Postal Service or the third-party commercial carrier containing the recipient's signature and showing the date of delivery as \_\_\_\_\_ [month/date], 20\_\_\_. [*Attach the signed delivery confirmation showing the date of delivery.*]

B. \_\_\_\_ U.S. Mail or third-party commercial carrier with a recipient's signature recorded or to be recorded by the U.S. Postal Service or the third-party commercial carrier upon delivery. However, the delivery confirmation from the U.S. Postal Service or the third-party commercial carrier containing the recipient's signature is not available to me at this time. On \_\_\_\_\_ [month/date], 20\_\_\_, by the time of \_\_:\_\_ AM/PM, at \_\_\_\_\_ [*address where you provided the documents to the U.S. Postal Service or the third-party commercial carrier*], copies of the attached Formal Complaint and Notice of Filing were provided to the U.S. Postal Service or the third-party commercial carrier, with the respondent's address appearing on the envelope or package containing these documents, and with proper postage or delivery charge prepaid. [*Within seven days after it becomes available to you, file with the Board's Clerk the delivery confirmation—containing the recipient's signature and showing the date of delivery—and identify the Formal Complaint to which that delivery confirmation corresponds.*]

C. \_\_\_\_ Personal service and I made the personal delivery on \_\_\_\_\_ [month/date], 20\_\_\_, by the time of \_\_:\_\_ AM/PM.



D. \_\_\_ Personal service and another person made the personal delivery. Attached is the affidavit of service signed by the other person (or the declaration of service signed by the process server) who made the personal delivery, showing the date of delivery as \_\_\_\_\_ [month/date], 20\_\_\_. [Attach the other person's signed affidavit or declaration showing the date of delivery.]

E. \_\_\_X\_\_\_ Personal service and I will make the personal delivery. However, the affidavit of service is not available to me currently.

RESPONDENTS' ADDRESS:

**Name:** Carillon at Cambridge Lakes by DR Horton  
**Street:** 1185 Heritage Ct  
**City/State/Zip:** Pingree Grove

**Name:** Earthworks Environmental, LLC.  
**Street:** 6640 E Baseline Rd  
**City/State/Zip:** Mesa, AZ 65206

*Paul Christian Protapas*  
Complainant's Signature

**Street:** 1330 E. Chicago Ave.

**City, State, Zip Code:** Naperville, IL 60540

**Date:** 11/18/2022

Subscribed to and sworn before me

this 18th day

of November, 2022

M. Mascitti  
Notary Public



My Commission Expires: 5/21/2023



Office of the Secretary of State Jesse White  
ilsos.gov

## Corporation/LLC Search/Certificate of Good Standing

### Corporation File Detail Report

|             |                   |
|-------------|-------------------|
| File Number | 57133252          |
| Entity Name | D.R. HORTON, INC. |
| Status      | ACTIVE            |

| Entity Information           |                          |
|------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Entity Type                  | CORPORATION              |
| Type of Corp                 | FOREIGN BCA              |
| Qualification Date (Foreign) | Tuesday, 12 January 1993 |
| State                        | DELAWARE                 |
| Duration Date                | PERPETUAL                |

| Agent Information |           |
|-------------------|-----------|
| Name              | Exhibit B |

C T CORPORATION SYSTEM

Address

208 SO LASALLE ST, SUITE 814  
CHICAGO , IL 60604

Change Date

Tuesday, 12 January 1993

**Annual Report**

Filing Date

Friday, 13 May 2022

For Year

2022

**Officers**

President

Name & Address

DAVID V AULD 1341 HORTON CIRCLE ARLINGTON TX 76011

Secretary

Name & Address

THOMAS B MONTANO 1341 HORTON CIRCLE ARLINGTON TX 76011

**Assumed Name**

ACTIVE

D.R. HORTON CUSTOM HOMES

[Return to Search](#)

[File Annual Report](#)

[Adopting Assumed Name](#)

[Change of Registered Agent and/or Registered Office](#)

12/16/22, 10:38 AM

Corporation/LLC Search/Certificate of Good Standing  
**Electronic Filing: Received, Clerk's Office 12/19/2022**  
(One Certificate per Transaction)

This information was printed from [www.ilsos.gov](http://www.ilsos.gov), the official website of the Illinois Secretary of State's Office.

Fri Dec 16 2022

